

## Evaluation on Educational Human Resource Issues of Rrecruitment and Selection To Improve Educational Performance

Muslem Daud<sup>1</sup>  
[muslem.daud@serambimekkah.ac.id](mailto:muslem.daud@serambimekkah.ac.id)

Bor-Chen Kuo<sup>2</sup>  
[kbc@ntcu.edu.tw](mailto:kbc@ntcu.edu.tw)

Ratna Mutia<sup>3\*</sup>  
[ratnamutia@serambimekkah.ac.id](mailto:ratnamutia@serambimekkah.ac.id)

Bansu Irianto Ansari<sup>4</sup>  
[bansuansari58@gmail.com](mailto:bansuansari58@gmail.com)

Jamaluddin<sup>5</sup>  
[jamaluddin@ar-raniry.ac.id](mailto:jamaluddin@ar-raniry.ac.id)

Yusrizal<sup>6</sup>  
[yusrizal\\_fkipunsyiah@yahoo.co.id](mailto:yusrizal_fkipunsyiah@yahoo.co.id)

<sup>1&3</sup>Universitas Serambi Mekkah

<sup>2</sup>National Taichung University of Education

<sup>4</sup>Universitas Jabal Ghafur

<sup>5</sup>Universitas Islam Negeri Ar Raniry

<sup>6</sup>Universitas Syiah Kuala

\*Corresponding Author: Ratna muti, [ratnamutia@serambimekkah.ac.id](mailto:ratnamutia@serambimekkah.ac.id)

### Abstract

This article evaluates aspects of educational recruitment and selection for educators. The study is based on literature review as a method by collecting data and information to support the discussion in the study. The result of the study shows that a planned recruitment, well managed and accountable selection process will bring a positive impact on educational development and otherwise. It suggests that recruitment and selection processes should be carried out properly to find best recruiters to continually improve education performance with newer resources.

*Keywords: Evaluation, education actors, recruitment, selection.*

### Problem Statement

Lack of qualified workforce in remote educational schools and even a town in a province has become a problem caused by the limited process of recruitment and selection to overcome the workforce. As a matter of fact, based on the literature review above proper recruitment and selection process would result in a potential human resource of teachers and lecturers. The new recruiters would bring impact positively on education in the educational process. Therefore, it is identified that when recruitment and selection process did not managed properly would bring education low performance that would likely because of unqualified teachers and education actors.

### Research Objective

This research is aimed to explore important aspects to be paid attention in educational human resource recruitment and selection.

### Research Question

The following is the research question:

1. What are important aspects to be paid attention to in educational human resource recruitment and selection?

### Literature Review

#### Recruitment Process

Every organization, including schools and universities in the public and private sectors, has a mission statement as well as objectives to be achieved (Bryson, 1995). When recruitment of employees is based on the mission and objectives, this recruitment becomes strategic (Nankervis et al, 2002). Strategic planning is a way to manage the organization so it runs well, by predicting any change and challenges which might occur in the future (Clark, 1994). Bryson (1995) claims that human resource planning is a significant tool to create success. Some organizations might have different ways of achieving their goals and differ in the fundamental way that they behave or aim to be successful (Bass, 1990). Thus, their recruitment process might be quite distinct from those used in other organizations.

According to Nankervis et al. (2002), recruitment strategies must stand alongside and be aligned with higher-level strategies. Higher-level strategies begin with the vision and mission statements, strategic objectives of the organization, policy strategies toward internal and external environment, promotion strategies, and so forth. In other words, strategic recruitment including contingency planning is an integral part of the whole organizational strategy (Collins, 1993). Therefore, talking about strategic recruitment is talking about planning and the future of the organization (Cook, 1988). Indeed, good planning for recruitment is essential to identify clear criteria for the persons and skills required to achieve short and long term organizational objectives (Randolph and Posner, 1992). A strategic recruitment framework compiled by Stones (1998, p. 175), makes the process clear.

Highly developed organizations have short-term and long-term goals as a Return On Investment (ROI) (Eiteman et al., 2001). The organization might hope for millions of dollars in the first to the fifth year, while for long-term goals they might expect billions of dollars in twenty-five years or fifty years. This profit goal will be different depending on how large the organization is and its capacity. In addition, the organization would also consider aspects regarding market demand, customers' fluctuation, market niches and their competitive advantages and so forth (Cascio, 1995). In fact, liable and adequate human resource has the potential to support the organization in achieving its objectives (Cope and Kalantzis, 1997).

Human resource planning involves determining the number and type of jobs to be filled within the organization (Schuler et al, 1992). The number required fluctuates depending on the types of job: permanent, part-time or casual job. The organization also has to consider the job divisions, authority and responsibility for line managers and supervisors (Barnett and Wilsted, 1988). In fact all human resource planning is much more dependent on job analysis as a historical record for organizational strategic purposes and human resource development (Walters, 1995). Therefore, the organization must decide on the job to be performed by one employee only. On the other hand, some jobs need more employees because the workloads associated with them are high. Consequently, the organization must redeploy employees to make the organization more effective (Murphy and Cleveland, 1991). Alternatively, the organization must start a new recruitment program to support the continuity of its purpose.

Based on a job analysis, the organization already has a clear idea on the organizational needs related to its human resource (Nankervis et al, 2002). The organization already knows the *job specification* and *job description* of positions to be filled (Lynton and Pareek, 1994). Job specification includes details of experience, qualifications, specific skill levels, abilities, knowledge, personal qualities and other special requirements that should be fulfilled by the candidates (Gatewood and Field, 1990). A job description should include the job title, the duties and the responsibilities, the relationships of the position to those in a higher position and subordinates, the accountability and the authority of the position (Kramar et al, 1998). Stones (1998, p.176-182) clarifies some critical components to make recruitment strategic: the planning stage, the future recruitment, internal consideration and the recruiter.

### **The Planning**

The planning stage is concerned with specifying job vacancies which occur when a particular position is left by previous staff because of promotion or staff turnover or arise as the result of new technology and because of increased demand (Shuler et al., 1993). Clark (1994) suggests that the planning stage should be concerned with new positions provided to promote current employees. When particular skills are required and there is no current staff member in possession of those specific skills, then, a plan to welcome outsiders is required.

As part of planning, the organization needs to consider specific policies that are applied both internally and externally to the organization (Nankervis et al., 2002). Internal application means policies applied within the organization, while external means policies, laws and regulations applied externally to the organization in particular countries toward job opportunities and equality (Gatewood and Field, 1990).

Meanwhile, according to Stones (1998) there is a long list of issues that are very important when an organization considers its policies for recruitment. The policies might be different from one country to the other. Those policies are usually related to the following topics (Stones, 1998, p. 176):

1. Equal employment opportunity (EEO) policies
2. Promotion policies
3. Personnel from local, interstate or international resources
4. Permanent, part-time or casual employment
5. Hiring persons with disabilities
6. Hiring women and minority groups (affirmative action)
7. Employees taking early or normal retirement
8. Employing gay and lesbian personnel (non discrimination)
9. Employing relatives, friends of existing employees
10. Employing children domestically and internationally
11. Employing union and non-union members
12. Balance of technical skill, formal qualification and values of applicant
13. Selection method and media of recruitment
14. Decision to inform applicant about position, career, company, product and so on
15. Decision about the time to inform applicants concerning job vacancies.

### **Future Recruitment**

Future recruitment deals with the identification of predicted organizational needs for the future workforce (Nankervis et al., 2002). The expansion of the organization is a good reason for the organization to prepare itself with reliable planning to find the best staff with all the variety of skills required (Kramar et al., 1998). Austin and Kohn (1990) suggested that multinational companies can

face an unnecessary situation if they do not give job opportunities to local people. Pucik et al. (1992) have also indicated that companies might get into trouble when local people are living in poor conditions and they see outsiders coming in and doing business in their area. Moreover, even though a company receives protection from the government, like the Indonesian military, this does not necessarily stop local people causing problems by holding demonstrations and protests.. Therefore, for future recruitment, it is wise to consider employing local people where possible in the business even if only as casual workers (Dowling et al., 1994).

### **Internal Consideration**

Internal consideration specifically deals with creating opportunities for existing employees to take over vacant positions (Clark, 1994). Therefore, there are two types of recruitment process, internal and external recruitment (Scarpello and Ledvinka, 1988). Internal recruitment refers to the process of selecting existing employees for specific positions within the organization (Lynton and Pareek, 1990). Internal consideration is also part of the recruitment process that is concerned with performance appraisal, promotion and transfers (Nankervis et al., 2002).

According to Stones (1998), there are advantages and disadvantages of internal recruitment. One of the advantages is that the organization has knowledge of a candidate's strengths and weaknesses, and the candidate already knows the organization. Internal recruitment is economical and would increase an employee's morale and motivation toward the job and can generate a succession of promotions.

At the same time, some of the disadvantages of internal recruitment are that existing employees might be promoted beyond their level of competence and infighting for promotion can affect morale. Also this 'inbreeding' can stifle creativity and innovation and the system of the organization can become very bureaucratic.

### **The Recruiter/Employment Agency**

When an organization makes the decision to hire or employ outsiders to fill the job vacancies, they often let an independent employment agency supply them with suitable applicants (Stones, 1998). According to Stones (1998, p.180-189), there are twelve ways to conduct external recruitment:

1. Advertising
2. Government employment agencies
3. Personnel consultancies
4. Management recruitment consultant
5. Executive search firm (headhunting)
6. Outplacement firm
7. Executive leasing
8. University recruiting
9. Employee referral
10. Unsolicited application (walk ins and write ins)
11. Professional application
12. Trade unions.

In addition, electronic recruitment (e-cruitment) is another way of finding new staff. In fact, an online recruitment site like *monster.com.au* estimated 200.000 Australians had their resumé online at the end of 2000 (Nankervis et al, 2002. p. 262).

Creating the opportunities for external candidates to fill the job vacancies has several

advantages and some disadvantages (DeSimone and Harris, 1998). Above all, the advantage for an organization is the gathering of a large pool of talented applicants (Eder and Ferris, 1989). By selecting and then employing new people from the pool, the organization will gain new insight and new skills from these candidates (Granton et al, 1999).

### **Selection Process**

Stones (1998) argues that recruitment is an effort by the organization to search for information about potential human resources that could be engaged upon meeting the qualifications, experiences and skills required. Selection is an opportunity for an organization to search for the validity of information given by these potential human resources through their applications or gathered by the organization (when it conducts internal recruitment). Therefore, Nankervis et al. (2002) claim that selection is aimed at choosing the best applicant from the pool of applicants and to prove the validity of the information before the organization considers accepting the new employees.

Practically, according to Clark (1994, p. 243), the selection process is mainly intended to look for four types of information: substantive information, progress of job history, stability of previous work records and prediction about the likelihood of success on the job. Therefore, the selection process begins with the matching of applications to the job requirements. The job requirement mainly covers profile, criteria and experience needed in the job. When the organization has considered some applicants who have the competencies to do the job, the organization might weigh the application forms for further selection purposes.

The weighted application form consists of some basic data of applicants with regard to personal details, educational background, previous employment and experiences and application support materials (Clark, 1994). The weighted application would be brought to the interview and tested to get the validity of the data from the applicants. In addition, some applicants, however, would be placed on the waiting list until the first selection process for the applicants failed (Nankervis et al, 2002). The organization might then call them in for the interview and the test.

### **Interview**

Most organizations in Australia have been using interviews and tests to confirm the validity of the information given in the application forms (Clark, 1994). In some situations however, the selection test is conducted before the interview. The interview and the test focus on substantive information, progress of job history, stability of previous work records and prediction about the likelihood of success on the job (Stones, 1998). The substantive information is about the qualifications or educational background that will support the applicants' ability to do the job. Progress of job history is the experience of the applicant that would be useful in the job. Stability of previous work record is the information about the previous position of applicants. Meanwhile, the prediction of likelihood of the success of the job relates to the chances of each applicant achieving the future success in the job if they are hired by the organization. Some applicants might have strengths and weaknesses that would be brought to the panel interview.

However, some interviews are not effective and they do not confirm the validity of the information that was previously obtained because most of the time the interviews are influenced by the interviewers (Stones, 1998). Therefore according to Clark (1994, p. 248), there are should be some effort to improve the interview process, such as selecting appropriate interviewers to conduct the interviews, providing training on how to interview, providing interviewers with guidelines on what the interview looks for and conducting panel interviews to confirm the validity of data obtained from the interviews.

## Test

The test is another method to confirm the validity of the information gained from the applicants before taking the final decision to hire them (Stones, 1998). The test is focused on the gathering of information about the actual competency of each of the applicants. According to Nankervis et al. (2002, p. 213) the test is an objective and standardized measure of a sample behavior that is used to measure a person's abilities, aptitudes, interest or behavior in relation to other individuals. The test is formulated to measure the above potencies. Some applicants might have good qualifications but they may not have good experience.

Most tests would be based on the analysis of job vacancies that required specific competencies, experience and skills. The test also includes a behavior test that is crucial to see the personal interest toward the job, the interpersonal relationship and the environment of the applicant (Alder, 2001).

The last process of selection is *making the decision* based on the results of the interview and the results of the test (Clark, 1994). The combination of these results would determine the strengths and the weaknesses of the applicants (Cascio, 1995). The applicants who have more strengths in qualification and experience, would be the first priority to be selected and to be employed. However in some cases, some applicants with a good perception of behavior and have a number of strengths is preferable. The reason is that they have competencies which can still be improved through training and brought into line with the job requirements and the organizational needs.

## Evaluation Human Resource Management in Recruitment and Selection

Recruitment is "the process of attempting to locate and encourage potential applicants to apply for an existing or anticipated job opening" (Nankervis et al., 2002, p.241). According to Clark (1994, p.253), recruitment is "the process of searching for and identifying job candidates in sufficient quantity and sufficient quality to meet organizational human resource needs". Meanwhile Schuler et al. (1992, p. 204) define recruitment as "searching for and obtaining potential job candidates in sufficient numbers and quality for the organization to select the most appropriate people to fill its job".

After recruitment, selection is the next step of strategic human resources to choose the best applicants to be employed by the organization. According to Clark (1994), selection is a critical step to confirm the validity of the information provided in the applications submitted by the job applicants.

According to Stones (1998) and Clark (1994), there are difficulties that affect organizations' open recruitment and selection process. These are pressure of competition, cost saving, downsizing, skill shortage and cultural change, besides the regular turnover of workers. Recruitment and selection are the way to motivate existing employees and to become refreshed by engaging new staff. It is part of the brief of human resource management to assist an organization to achieve its goals (Kramar et al., 1998).

In a broader view, Nankervis et al. (2002, p. 242) say "the key point to be made is that recruitment strategies flow ultimately from the organization's mission statement and strategic objectives". In fact, finance, laws and regulations have become big issues in the recruitment process (Mullins, 2002). Recruitment and selection are the ways to ensure that the workload is performed continuously, either by recruiting employees or potential candidates from outside the organization (Stones, 1998). In some occasions, the workload becomes bigger when the demand for products is higher (Nankervis et al, 2002). In this case, the organization would increase the work expected of its workers to fulfill the demand of customers. However, when the workload is inappropriately shared by existing workers, the company must open the recruitment process to outsiders (Bacal, 1999) in order to get sufficient

staff to meet the demands.

Competition among organizations, even among education institutions, becomes a major reason for recruitment (Alston, 1986). The organization always wants to gain a competitive advantage by creating a new product with unique characteristics and market niches over other products from other organizations (Collins, 1993). In this case, highly skilled persons who have a variety of expertise are required to bring new ideas to the organizations/ schools and universities. As a result, organizations would gain a competitive advantage from the new members of staff who contribute more profit to the organizations (Eder and Ferris, 1989).

Cost saving and downsizing are considerations in multinational profit-driven organizations (Eiteman et al., 2001). When new technological devices are used, the organizations need to hire new staff members with new skills to run them. In fact, using new technology has created few job vacancies and cut 10 to 50 percent of previous jobs (Granton et al., 1999). As a result, many jobs are taken over by technology and manual workers have little chance to perform the jobs. However, from the recruitment perspective, the new staff members who replace the manual workers are expected to give more flexibility as well as produce better products for the organization (Dowling et al., 1994).

Skill shortage and cultural change are also two important reasons for organizations to recruit employees (Stones, 1998). An organization's lack of human resource is usually associated with a lack of appropriate skills. As a result, the organization cannot run its daily operations smoothly because some work cannot be performed (Kramar et al., 1998). Meanwhile, cultural change is part of an organizations' response toward the current phenomena both internally and externally. Part of the internal culture of the organization is the changing leadership styles because of a leader's succession. New leaders might apply a different style of leadership when running the organization. They might reform and add some new tasks for employees (Bryson, 1995).

As part of the external culture, some consideration should be given to the changes occurring outside the organization (Dowling et al., 1999). In some cultures, women are encouraged to work as late as midnight while it was unacceptable before (Alston, 1986). This change creates a good opportunity for the organizations to open recruitment to women because the organization does not need to consider social barriers which were in place some decades ago. In fact, because female workers in some Asian countries are paid less than male workers, some organizations have recruited female workers by preference to reduce their wages bill (Austin and Kohn, 1990).

Another reason for recruitment and selection is the turnover of employees (Clark, 1994). This is "the process of employees leaving an organization" (Stones, 1998, p. 135). In most countries where worker's remuneration is very competitive, employee turnover is very high as well. The employees feel less loyalty to their organizations and they tend to look for more financial satisfaction in another organization (Alston, 1986). According to research, turnover of staff in Australia cost as much as one billion dollars a year (Stones, 1998).

### **Conclusion and Suggestion**

Based on the above discussion it can conclude that:

1. There are issues in teachers and lecturer as well as education actors recruitment need to be paid attention to make educational improvement continuously take place.
2. Literature review suggests the importance of proper recruitment and selection.
3. Two important aspects in recruitment and selection are planning and testing.
4. The result of the study shows that a planned recruitment, well managed and accountable selection process brings a positive impact on educational development.
5. It suggests that recruitment and selection processes should be carried out properly to find

best recruiters to continually improve education performance with newer resources.

### References

- Alder, R. (2001). *Interplay, the process of interpersonal communication*. Eighth edition. Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Alston, J.P. (1986). *The American Samurai: Blending American and Japanese Managerial Practice*. Walter de Gruiter & Co.:
- Austin, J.E. and Kohn, T.O. (1990). *Strategic Management in Developing Countries*. The Free Press:
- Bacal, R. (1999). *Performance Management*. McGraw-Hill..
- Barnett, J. H. and Wilsted, W.D. (1988). *Strategic Management; Concept and Cases*. PWS-Kent Publishing Company..
- Bass, B. M. (1990). *Bass and Stogdill's Handbook of Leadership; Theory, research and managerial application*. The Free Press.
- Bryson, J.M. (1995). *Strategic Planning for Public and Nonprofit Organizations- A Guide to strengthening and sustaining organizational achievement*. Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Cascio, W.F. (1995). *Managing Human Resources; Productivity, quality of work life, profit*. McGraw-Hill, Inc.
- Clark, R. (1994). *Australian Human Resources Management; Framework and Practice*. McGraw-Hill book company.
- Collins, R. (1993). *Effective Management – Consultant Editor*. New Zealand limited..
- Cook, M. (1988). *Personnel Selection and Productivity*, John Wiley & sons, Inc.
- Cope, B. and Kalantzis, M., 1997, *Productive Diversity; A new Australian model for work and management*. Pulto Press Australia.
- DeSimone, R.L. and Harris, D.M. (1998). *Human Resource Development*. The Dryden Press.
- Dowling, P.J., Schuler, R.S. and Welch, D.E. (1994). *International Dimension of Human Resources Management*, Ward-worth, Inc.
- Dowling, P.J., Welch, D.E. and Schuler, R.S. (1999). *International Dimension of Human Resources Management: Managing People in a Multinational Context*. South-Western College Publishing.
- Eder, R.W. and Ferris, G. R. (1989). *The Employment Interview*. Sage publication: London.
- Eiteman, D.K, Stonehill, A.I and Moffett, M.H. (2001). *Multinational Business Finance*, Ninth Edition, Addison-Wesley publishing company.
- Gatewood, R.D. and Field, H. S. (1990). *Human Resources Selection*. The Dryden Press.
- Granton, L., Halley, V.H., Stiles, P. and Truss. (1999). *Strategic Human Resources Management; Corporate Rhetoric and Human Reality*. Oxford University Press.
- Kramar, R., McGraw, P. and Schuler, R.S. (1998). *Human Resource Management in Australia*. Addison Wesley Longman Australia Pty. Ltd..
- Lynton, R.P. and Pareek, U. (1994). *Training for Development*. Kumarian Press: Connecticut-USA.
- Mullins, J.L. (2002). *Management and Organizational Behavior*. Pitman.
- Murphy, K.R. and Cleveland, J.N. (1991). *Performance Appraisal: An Organizational Perspective*. Allyn and Bacon.
- Nankervis, A., Compton, R., and Baird, M. (2002). *Strategic Human Resource Management*. Nelson Australia Pty Limited.
- Pucik, V., Tichy, N.M. and Barnett, C.K. (1992). *Globalizing Management*. John Wiley & sons, Inc.
- Randolph, W. A. and Posner, B. Z. (1992). *Getting the Job Done - Managing project teams and Task Forces for Success*. Prentice Hall, Inc
- Scarpello, V.G. and Ledvinka, J. (1988). *Personnel/ Human Resource Management*. PWS-Kent Publishing Company..
- Schuler, R.S, Dowling, P.J., Smart, J.P. and Huber, V. L. (1992). *Human Resource Management in Australia*. Harper Educational Publishers.
- Shuler, H, Farr, J.L. and Smith, M. (1993). *Personnel Selection and Assessment: Individual and Organizational Perspectives*. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.



Stones, J. (1998). *Human Resource Management*. Third Edition. Jacaranda Wiley Ltd.: Melbourne.  
Walters, M. (1995). *The Performance Management Handbook*. Institute of Personnel Development.